

Of the eight chapters, four are mainly biographical in nature, sketching the background of Krautheimer – the son of Nathan Krautheimer, a successful Jewish businessman, and Martha Landmann – his student years and early professional activities, his years as lecturer (*Privatdozent*) at the University of Marburg, the disastrous political events of 1933 and the first years after his emigration from Germany, which he spent in Rome before going to the United States. A chapter is dedicated to Krautheimer's two early publications, respectively on mendicant churches, *Die Kirchen der Bettelorden in Deutschland* (1925) and on medieval synagogues in the German speaking countries, *Mittelalterliche Synagogen* (1927), and another to the rediscovered history of German architecture. Two chapters are devoted to the research and projects of these years that resulted in his groundbreaking later publications: the five-volume corpus of the Early Christian basilicas of Rome, *Corpus Basilicarum Christianarum Romae* (1937–77) and the essay 'Iconography of medieval architecture', published in the *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes* in 1942. Krautheimer's lost *Habilitation* on European sculpture around 1400, which he completed at Marburg in 1928, is also discussed. Central themes that return in all chapters are the nature and development of the art-historical discipline at German universities in the years between the wars; tensions between Jewish identity, German patriotism and an international outlook; and the threat posed by dictatorial and racist tendencies that would lead to the Nazi regime.

The story of a talented, self-assured and ambitious young man navigating a complex and not always favourable academic world is told in detail. A prominent part is played by Richard Hamann, then professor in Marburg and Krautheimer's superior. Herklotz confirms that Hamann was not, as was once thought, a hero of the left who stood up to the Nazi regime. The fact that three monographic studies and a conference volume have been devoted to Hamann's work, whereas 'Krautheimer's incomparably more influential work has so far received only sporadic attention' (p.9) is a mystery to Herklotz. The author contextualises Krautheimer's life and career; many pages are devoted to scholarly debates and institutional history, with instructive but sometimes seemingly disorientating digressions, for example on the careers of fellow art historians. In the end, however, they prove to be relevant for the

biographical thread and they add a touch of subtle narrative suspense to the book.

Krautheimer's works are critically assessed. For example, the writings of Kurt Gerstenberg and others, who emphasised what they considered a German type of Gothic called *Sondergotik*, which was inspired by nationalism, are compared to Krautheimer's study of mendicant Gothic architecture. The latter was also not free from national pathos but it presented an analytical analysis of the evidence, a merit that Krautheimer himself later recognised. Herklotz suggests that Krautheimer's understanding of the structure and space of these churches may also have been influenced by his appreciation of contemporary Bauhaus architecture. The book on medieval synagogues is introduced with an illuminating discussion of Jewish scholarship and Jewish subjects. In retrospect Krautheimer described this book as an attempt to explore his Jewish roots at a time when the desire to assimilate drove him to be 'as German as all others' (p.77). Herklotz emphasises the pioneering qualities of Krautheimer's systematic analysis of construction campaigns and architectural sculpture that provided a coherent method of dating, a framework that would be perfected in the *Corpus Basilicarum*. At the same time, he observes that Krautheimer's 'profane' conception of the synagogue, according to which the building was not primarily a house of worship, has not withstood modern research. The issue of patriotism returns in *Die Geschichte der deutschen Baukunst*, of which the first part (covering the period until the fourteenth century) has been preserved in typescript. It reveals an author who was closely familiar with the paradigms of the Germanness (*Deutschum*) of his teachers and colleagues, but who distinguished himself by an open-mindedness towards the European context. This approach, which was not determined by traditional frameworks, was conveyed in the relaxed style of writing that would characterise his later contributions to architectural history. Herklotz interprets these qualities as the first signs of an emancipation from an art-historical discipline that adhered to formal and stylistic concepts of teleological character, often with a strong nationalistic tendency.

Although the book does not pretend to provide a psychological portrait, the reader gains a close insight into Krautheimer's personality. A bright, serious, determined, witty and articulate man, he was characterised by a remarkable mental stability. Trude Hess,

with whom he had a childless marriage, was his lifelong ally. All the more shocking are the last chapters, with their history of exclusion and exile, of the loss of family members in the Holocaust and of the poisoning of the art-historical institute in Marburg by a nationalist and racist ideology that permeated every fibre of academic life, destroying both scientific ethics and human loyalty.

As Herklotz points out, Krautheimer himself perceived a break in his art-historical approach and general attitude of mind after his emigration. Nonetheless, the author convincingly argues that the seeds of his intellectual breakthrough in the United States are to be found in his formative years in Germany. Remarkably, Krautheimer never returned to the synagogue as a subject of study after 1933. On the other hand, his profound interest in Christian church architecture, not only in its formal qualities but also in its religious significance and liturgical functions, which developed in his German years and above all during his stays in Rome, remained a focus of research until his death in the papal city.

¹ See, for example, the introduction and postscripts in R. Krautheimer: *Ausgewählte Aufsätze zur europäischen Kunstgeschichte*, Cologne 1988.

Making Strange: The Modernist Photobook in France

By Kim Sichel. 224 pp. incl. 120 col. + 20 b. & w. ill. (Yale University Press, New Haven and London, 2020), £50. ISBN 978-0-300-24618-6.

by IAN WALKER

In 2004 Gerry Badger and Martin Parr published the first substantial volume of a three-part study of the photobook. They demonstrated that by creating visual narratives, which offer a richness of meaning unequalled in other uses of the medium, the book is a central form of display for photography.¹ In the past two decades, much work has been undertaken in examining the photobook more closely. Most of these studies have analysed either a specific time frame or a place of origin.² As its subtitle indicates, Kim Sichel's book brings time and place together: the first half of the twentieth century in France.

The central part of the book comprises four chapters that present four case studies, one per decade, from the 1920s to the 1950s. The first is *Métal* by Germaine Krull, a

Books

celebration of the Machine Age published in 1928 that comprises tightly cropped images of the Eiffel Tower and other modernist structures in Paris and Rotterdam (Fig.8). Sichel previously wrote the major English-language monograph on Krull's rich career.³ The second, more famous, is Brassai's *Paris de nuit* from 1933, which chronicles the nightlife of the artist's adopted city. Sichel begins this chapter by recalling her discovery of Brassai's lost glass negatives in the attic of a publishing house in 1984. The third book, *Les morts et les statues* by Pierre Jahan, is less well known. It combines photographs of Parisian statues taken down by the occupying Germans in 1941 with a text by Jean Cocteau. The last of the four chapters concerns one of the most famous photobooks of all: a collection of photographs by Henri Cartier-Bresson published in 1952 in France as *Images à la Sauvette* and in the United States as *The Decisive Moment*. The two titles had very different implications, the French 'à la sauvette' suggesting activities that are shady and illicit, as opposed to the positivity of 'decisive'.

There is clarity and order to Sichel's structure, but the focus on only four books means that other works that would have been worthy of study are left out. All the books discussed by Sichel are documentary in nature, and it might have been interesting to include an example of a more experimental photobook, such as Man Ray's *La Photographie n'est pas l'art* (1937), which combined twelve seemingly unrelated images, including a colony of ants and a head shot of a famous actress. Some of the most intriguing photobooks work on the edges of the form in hybrid, undecidable ways.

What Sichel has chosen to discuss, however, she deals with fully, backed up by a formidable body of research. *Making Strange* is lavishly illustrated and, with each example, she covers a range of responses ranging from the physical experience of holding the book to the social, political and aesthetic contexts it occupies. The contributions of such writers as Cocteau and Pierre MacOrlan, who wrote texts for photobooks by Eugène Atget and André Kertész, are discussed and related books by other photographers, such as Moï Ver (*Paris*; 1931), Bill Brandt (*A Night in London*; 1938) and Robert Doisneau (*La banlieue de Paris*; 1949), are referenced. Sichel's writing is accessible and detailed if sometimes rather stolid.

There are a few mistakes and misreadings. Sichel's presentation of Surrealism, for example, is rather loose. André Breton's



Nadja and *L'Amour fou* are not novels, and Man Ray's photograph of a flamenco dancer is not included in the former but the latter, as she states correctly elsewhere in the book. The key Surrealist concept 'le merveilleux' should not be translated as 'fantastic' (p.102); the more obvious 'marvellous' is better. It is also curious that all four chapters conclude by discussing later American photobooks by such artists as Walker Evans (*American Photographs*; 1938), Martha Rosler (*3 Works*; 1981) and Lee Friedlander (*The American Monument*; 1976). It is if the French works have to be validated by their American counterparts, which – although this book is written by an American scholar for a primarily American audience – is undoubtedly unfair.

8. Plate 37 from *Métal*, by Germaine Krull. 1928. Collotype, 29 by 22.5 cm. (© Estate Germaine Krull; Folkwang Museum, Essen; courtesy Harvard Library Imaging Services).

Sichel has been committed to the study of French photography for a long time, and it is unfortunate that the book is pulled sideways in these short but telling sections.

This is also relevant to the concluding chapter, 'Transitions: from Paris to New York and Japan', which takes the reader into the 1950s. It is at first a surprise to see a discussion of two other quintessentially American photobooks: Robert Frank's *The Americans* (1958) and William Klein's *Life is Good and Good for You in New York* (1956). But in fact, both these books were first published

in Paris, and Sichel analyses in depth the love-hate relationship between France and America during that period. However, she then goes on to discuss the Japanese Provoke movement, which took the photobook to a more transgressive place, both in terms of the techniques used and the attitudes espoused. It feels a step too far and suggests that Sichel is finally more concerned to follow the development of the radical photobook rather than shifts in French photography and culture. A different but more appropriate conclusion might have been to look at the powerful photobooks produced at the end of the century by such French documentarians as Gilles Peress, Luc Delahaye and Raymond Depardon or, indeed, such artists as Christian Boltanski and Sophie Calle.⁴

The concluding chapter is not where the heart of Sichel's book lies. The four main chapters are more focused and full of rich references and analysis. They will find a deserved place in the literature on this subject, as part of the ever-developing understanding of the historical role of the photobook.

1 G. Badger and M. Parr: *The Photobook: A History*, I, London 2004.

2 See, for example, H. Fernández: *The Latin American Photobook*, New York 2011; M. Karasik: *The Soviet Photobook 1920–1941*, Göttingen 2015; and M. Parr and W. Lundgren, eds: *The Chinese Photobook: From the 1900s to the Present*, New York 2016.

3 See K. Sichel: *Germaine Krull: Photographer of Modernity*, Cambridge MA and London 1999.

4 See, for example, G. Peress: *Telex Persan*, Paris 1984; L. Delahaye: *Winterreise*, London 2000; R. Depardon: *Le Désert Américain*, Paris 1983; C. Boltanski: *Le Lycée Chases*, Düsseldorf 1987; and S. Calle: *Suite Vénitienne*, Paris 1983.

Short reviews

The McCarthy Collection

Volume I: Italian and Byzantine

Miniatures. By Gaudenz Freuler with Georgi Parpulov. 304 pp. incl. 250 col. ills. (*Ad Ilissvm*, London, 2018), £90. ISBN 978-1-912168-07-1.

Volume II: Spanish, English, Flemish and

Central European Miniatures. By Peter Kidd. 248 pp. incl. over 150 col. ills. (*Ad Ilissvm*, London, 2019), £80. ISBN 978-1-912168-13-2.

Volume III: French Miniatures. By Peter Kidd. 336 pp. incl. 350 col. ills. (*Ad Ilissvm*, London, 2021), £100. ISBN 978-1-912168-18-7.

by FREDERICA LAW-TURNER

The McCarthy Collection is a large private collection of cuttings from medieval illuminated manuscripts. It deserves to

be better known, as it certainly will be following the publication of this luxurious and extensively illustrated three-volume catalogue. Not limited to a single period or country, the collection offers a panorama of European illumination from the ninth century to the fifteenth.

Most cuttings are from religious books, with occasional exceptions such as the well-known fourteenth-century Chaworth genealogical roll of the kings of England. Also included are familiar fragments of the Hungerford, Knyvett, Felbrigg and Ghistelles Hours, and a delightful range of fourteenth- and fifteenth-century Netherlandish and German musical manuscripts.

Together the catalogue contains around 250 entries, some with multiple fragments of a single manuscript. The first volume includes cuttings from almost ninety Italian manuscripts, mainly large choirbooks, and eight Byzantine; the second has fragments of eight Spanish, ten English and nine Flemish manuscripts and thirty-four from central Europe. The third volume is devoted to the ninety-six French fragments, reflecting the collector's original interest in French Gothic art.

These are large and beautifully produced volumes, with colour illustrations of all leaves, often both recto and verso. Entries include useful identifications of sister leaves and parent volumes – and reconstructions of these where possible – and list published references both to the cutting itself and related publications. Commentaries on each summarise – and sometimes question – the current state of research on date, origin and ownership. There are numerous comparative illustrations and useful indices of iconography, artists, places and people.

The volume includes a number of new attributions, corrections and revisions to provenance. Peter Kidd rightly questions Branner's groupings of French Gothic manuscripts, attributing a number of leaves to Spain for the first time. The English fragments are of especially high quality. Kidd identifies two miniatures from a *Decretum Gratiani* by one of the Milemete artists, and two leaves from the Felbrigg Hours. He is especially interested in provenance, questioning the association of the Hungerford Hours with Thomas Wake and raising the intriguing possibility that the Flemish Ghistelles Hours was not made for the aristocratic John III of Ghistelles but for

a merchant or financier associated with the great fairs listed at the end of the calendar.

These catalogues are an important addition not just to field of fragmentology, but to manuscript studies as a whole and will form an invaluable jumping off point to further research. Sadly, they also illuminate the dismemberment of a large number of wonderful books, many in the nineteenth century but some more recently, and the inevitable losses, both actual and in terms of understanding, that result.

Städels Erbe: Meisterzeichnungen aus der Sammlung des Stifters

By Joachim Jacoby. 336 pp. incl. 239 col. ills. (*Sandstein Verlag*, Dresden, 2020), €49.90. ISBN 978-3-95498-548-7.

by STEFANIA GIROMETTI

The collection of drawings assembled by Johann Friedrich Städel (1728–1816), the founder of the art institute and museum in Frankfurt that bears his name, is renowned for its masterpieces, which include works by Albrecht Dürer, Claude Lorrain, Raphael, Rembrandt and Titian. Yet despite its fame, the drawings collection has never been thoroughly investigated. A first attempt to define the structure of the collection was made by Margret Stuffmann in 1991.¹ Thanks to Joachim Jacoby's meticulous research, this catalogue, which accompanied an exhibition held in Frankfurt in 2020, offers a comprehensive analysis of the collection. It consists of an introduction and ninety-five entries, divided into four groups (Italian, French, German as well as Dutch and Flemish). The catalogue is generously illustrated and supplemented by an appendix of documents, followed by an extensive bibliography and a helpful name index.

In his introductory essay Jacoby guides the reader through the complex origins of Städel's drawing collection, based on the wills Städel made in 1793, 1812 and 1815 as well as letters, inventories, accession lists, reports and auction catalogues. Several factors complicate the reconstruction of the works acquired before 1815. Städel did not use a collector's mark. No inventory from before 1815 has been discovered and one from 1825 lists only a selection of drawings. The first reliable inventory was drawn up in 1862–63, but by then